TERMS OF REFERENCE

PROGRAMME MONITORING AND IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
School Education Department
Government of Punjab

SECOND PUNJAB EDUCATION SECTOR PROJECT
PROPOSED
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
TO THE
ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN
PUNJAB PROVINCE

FOR

HIRING OF A SURVEY FIRM

FOR

IMPACT EVALUATION OF THE GOVERNMENT OF PUNJAB’S IMPROVERS BONUS PROGRAM FOR GOVERNMENT SCHOOL TEACHERS
1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

1.1. Beneficiary Country and Province

Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Punjab Province

1.2. Contracting Authority

Under the Second Punjab Education Sector Project and in agreement with the World Bank, the Programme Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU), School Education Department (SED), Government of the Punjab is the contracting authority.

1.3. BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVE

Government of the Punjab has received financing from the World Bank towards the cost of the Second Punjab Education Sector Project, and intends to apply part of the proceeds under Technical Assistance (Component II) for consulting services.

Under the Second Punjab Education Sector Reform Program (PESRP II), supported by the World Bank (WB), Government of the Punjab (GoPb) is seeking a reputable, experienced survey firm in Pakistan to conduct an extensive survey in a large sample of government primary schools as part of a program evaluation. The firm is expected to undertake all activities related to survey data collection, entry, and processing. Data quality is top priority; GoPb and WB will provide direct, close supervision to this end.

2. SCOPE

The survey is to be conducted in six (6) districts: Attock, Mandi Bahauddin, Rahim Yar Khan, Jhelum, Pakpattan, and Nankana Sahib.

The total number of schools to be surveyed is 1,650.

Disaggregation of schools by district is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attock</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandi Bahauddin</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rahimyar Khan</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jhelum</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nankana Sahib</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakpattan</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1650</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The list of schools will be provided to the contracted firm.
In each school, the survey will comprise of:

1. Data collected from school observation, including GPS of school;
2. Extraction of information from registers and records at school;
3. Interview of the (acting) head teacher using a survey instrument;
4. Interviews of all teachers using a survey instrument;
5. Tests of 10 students each in grades 4 and 5 (if number of students in the grade is less than 10, test all students); and
6. Interviews of tested students using a survey instrument.

3. **KEY TASKS AND RESPONSIBILITIES**

The key tasks and responsibilities of the contracted firm are as follows:

**a). General—all stages**

1) Contracted firm to strictly follow timetable for the survey activity agreed with GoP/WB impact evaluation (IE) team.

2) Contracted firm to maintain regular communication with GoP/WB IE team via audio conference, videoconference, and email correspondence regarding all aspects of the survey preparation, data collection, and data entry process.

3) Contracted firm to seek clearance from GoPb/WB IE team on all key decisions likely to impact the scope and quality of the survey work.

4) Contracted firm to provide timely feedback on all detailed assignments and instructions provided by GoPb/WB IE team in writing or verbally.

5) Contracted firm to provide GoPb/WB IE team with copies of its logistical planning and fielding documents as it relates to data collection and data entry activities for review and clearance.

6) Contracted firm to inform GoPb/WB IE team of any changes in survey personnel assigned to this project, along with clear justifications.

7) Contracted firm to seek guidance from GoPb/WB IE team before troubleshooting any sensitive/complex problems that arise during survey data collection and entry.

8) Contracted firm to strictly comply with all general independence, confidentiality, and professional integrity codes. Contracted firm to seek advice from GoPb/WB IE team when uncertain about requirements and expectations in this regard.

9) Contracted firm to permit GoPb/WB IE team or designated entities or individuals to monitor and inspect all or selected components of the survey activity.
Monitoring may take the form of unannounced visits to firm offices, training events, or schools under survey.

10) As needed, contracted firm to clean and prepare Government of Punjab (School Education Department, Punjab Examination Commission, Program Monitoring and Implementation Unit) administrative data relevant for the survey activity. This may entail verifying the accuracy of the data in the electronic administrative databases by cross-checking across multiple databases and against hardcopies and correcting data for mis-entered and missing values.

11) If Computer Assisted Personal Interviewing (CAPI) with handheld devices (e.g., tablet computers) and electronic questionnaires are to be used, the contracted firm will develop and test the necessary software. All equipment used as part of the survey (e.g., GPS handholds, smartphones, tablets, digital cameras) is to be provided by the contracted firm in the appropriate quantities and in full working order. Note: certain requirements and guidance provided below may not be relevant if CAPI is used.

**b). Stage 1: Field survey planning and preparation**

1) The contracted firm will receive first drafts of all questionnaires and tests from GoPb/WB IE team. Contracted firm to provide feedback on all survey, test, and monitoring instruments, particularly with respect to question appropriateness, question framing, response options, and content gaps.

2) Contracted firm to carefully and properly format all questionnaires, tests, and answer sheets to ensure that they are both user- and reader-friendly.

3) Contracted firm to pilot survey questionnaires and test instruments at appropriate schools as requested by GoPb/WB IE team.

4) Contracted firm to translate into Urdu (and any other local languages as needed) all survey instruments and relevant sections of tests. Contracted firm to make translated instruments available with adequate time to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance.

5) Contracted firm to mobilize teams of adequate numbers, proficiency, and professional integrity to handle the full scope and demands of the work, including appropriate field survey supervisors, survey interviewers and test invigilators, quality-control monitors, and data entry supervisors and operators.

6) Contracted firm to collect in standardized form and submit key relevant information on each survey staff member (coordinators, supervisors, interviewers, data entry operators, etc.) to GoPb/WB IE team.
7) Contracted firm to assign unique and permanent identification numbers to all field survey personnel.

8) Contracted firm to organize and administer all required trainings of field survey personnel.

9) Contracted firm to make available all field survey personnel for possible additional trainings offered by GoPb/WB IE team.

10) Contracted firm to (i) draft and translate into Urdu (and any other local languages as needed) all field survey and test administration manuals and (ii) make manuals available with adequate time to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance.

11) Contracted firm to (i) make field survey administration manuals available to all field survey personnel at trainings (ii) test knowledge of fieldwork procedures and acceptable behaviors after the completion of training and (iii) submit post-training test results to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance.

12) Contracted firm to ensure that field survey personnel only comprise of trainees who pass the post-training survey knowledge test.

13) Contracted firm to manage all fieldwork logistics and make fieldwork planning available to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance.

14) Contracted firm to develop field survey quality control protocols and procedures and submit to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance.

15) Contracted firm to mobilize a separate quality control unit to conduct random checks and investigate any quality control issues that arise.

c). Stage 2: Data collection

1) Contracted firm to follow all directives and instructions provided by GoPb/WB IE team with regards to survey methodology, survey sampling, and survey data management.

2) Contracted firm to field each survey and test instrument in the manner in which it is intended.

3) Contracted firm to collect GPS data and digital photographs from all schools, following data collection protocols reviewed and cleared by GoPb/WB IE team.

4) Contracted firm to fully and correctly fill in and maintain a field visit log of each school visited.
5) Contracted firm to ensure 100% assignment of unique and permanent identification information for schools, teachers, and students.

6) Contracted firm to ensure the development and effective application well-defined, reliable procedures to track schools, teachers, and sample students over survey rounds (if relevant).

7) Contracted firm to ensure quality control measures for data collection are applied at all schools.

8) Contracted firm to complete all information requested in daily and weekly field reports by GoPb/WB IE team.

9) Contracted firm to securely and safely maintain all filled-in questionnaires, tests, and forms from each school and make available to GoPb/WB IE team upon request.

10) Survey personnel of contracted firm to be respectful at all times to respondents (school administrators, teachers, and students).

11) Survey personnel of contracted firm to fully abide with the principles, regulations, and policies which apply to research involving human subjects. In addition, survey personnel of contracted firm to fully abide with all safeguards for research of vulnerable groups such as children and economically- and educationally-disadvantaged persons.

12) Contracted firm to put in place appropriate protections so that the risks of invasion of privacy and breach of confidentiality are minimized. Contracted firm to follow all standard requirements for obtaining and documenting informed consent from each prospective subject (parent, child, teacher, school administrator). In particular, contracted firm to make special provisions for soliciting the assent of children (taking account of the age, and maturity and comprehension levels of the child) and the permission of parents, guardians, or school officials before initiating any data collection. Contracted firm to ensure that data collection is undertaken in a culturally-sensitive fashion.

13) Contracted firm to inform GoPb/WB IE team, as soon as safety permits, of any security threat encountered during the course of field work, including, but not limited to, direct threats to survey personnel, generalized threats during the course of field work, and spontaneous occurrences of insecurity during fieldwork or travel.

d). Stage 3: Data entry
1) Contracted firm to develop a program for data entry. The program will follow all inputs from GoPb/WB IE team, including, but not limited to, verbal and written guidelines, data entry codebooks, and other advice. The data entry program will be shared and may be tested by GoPb/WB IE team prior to use.

2) Contracted firm to internally check the integrity and accuracy of data before transmitting to GoPb/WB IE team.

3) Contracted firm to provide preliminary data within 1 day of beginning data entry. This will serve as a preliminary check of proper data entry.

4) Contracted firm to prepare data entry quality control protocols and procedures and submit to GoPb/WB IE team for review and clearance. Mobilize a quality control unit.

5) Contracted firm to provide all logs and outputs of quality control checks done on data prior to transmitting the data to GoPb/WB IE team.

6) Contracted firm to enter all data simultaneously using two different data entry units (double entry), with each unit under independent supervision.

7) If requested by GoPb/WB IE team, contracted firm to reenter 10% of all survey questionnaires and tests as identified by GoPb/WB IE team using a different team of data entry operators under the oversight of and following the instructions of GoPb/WB IE team.

8) Contracted firm to correct any data entry errors identified and requested by GoPb/WB IE team.

9) Contracted firm to maintain a data entry log as specified to record progress and issues with data entry.

10) Contracted firm to scan all filled-in survey questionnaires, tests, and monitoring forms in an external hard drive.

4. **OUTPUTS**

Required outputs from the contracted firm include but are not limited to the following. GoPb/WB IE team reserves the right to request revisions and resubmissions as needed.

1) All survey instruments, tests, forms, and manuals prepared or revised by the contracted firm.

2) Reports and logs from survey and test field-testing activities.
3) Logistics plans and timetables.

4) Quality control plans for survey and test data collection and data entry.

5) All logs, journals, and reports from fieldwork.

6) Field survey administration report.

7) Survey and test data in electronic format in agreed templates and statistical format.

8) All multimedia information in electronic formats, with clear organization.

9) Scanned filled-in survey questionnaires, tests, forms and digital photos/videos in an external hard drive.

10) Data entry and processing report.

5. Timeframe:

The timeframe was the assignment is provided below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Estimated period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Review of past survey work for the impact evaluation</td>
<td>1 week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Inception report</td>
<td>2 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Development and finalization of survey instruments</td>
<td>3 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Planning and field preparation (including training and mobilization)</td>
<td>2 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Survey data collection, entry, and processing</td>
<td>6-8 weeks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Where possible, activities can be staggered to expedite completion.

6. Evaluation Criteria

For this purpose, PMIU intends to hire the services of a firm which has proven relevant background and experience working with the government. Evaluation criteria for evaluating the Expression of Interest (EOI) would be as follows:

a. Firm experience (attach certificate of incorporation), including qualified key staff (25 marks).

Definition of “Qualified Key Staff”: A key staff is considered qualified if he/she satisfies all of the following specifications:

   (i) holds at least a Masters’ degree; MA-5 scores, MPhil-6 scores, PhD-7 scores
(ii) has at least 2 previous experiences in survey administration work where
the survey questionnaire were administered to at least 1,200 individuals
(irrespective of organizational unit); 10 scores

(iii) in these prior survey experiences, he/she had similar roles and function as
his/her role and function for the assignment under this REI: 8 scores

In the same vein, a key staff is considered unqualified if he/she does not meet
any one of the aforementioned specifications. This definition of qualified key staff
applies to all parts of this REI.

b. Up to three Qualifying Survey Experiences (25 marks for each qualified
experience)

Definition of “Qualified Survey Experience”: A survey experience is considered qualified
if it satisfies all of the following specifications:

(i) it is relevant to this REI in terms of scope and tasks and responsibilities; 10 scores

(ii) it was administered wholly or partly in Punjab; 5 scores

(iii) it is a survey experience for which the firm took full responsibility of all
stages of survey administration, including pre-testing, field mobilization,
data collection, data entry and processing; 5 scores

(iv) the survey questionnaire was administered to at least 1,200 individuals
(irrespective of organizational unit) – i.e. at least 1,200 individuals were
interviewed for the survey; 5 scores

In the same vein, a survey experience is considered unqualified if it does not meet any
one of the aforementioned specifications. This definition of qualified survey experience
applies to all parts of the TOR.

7. Selection Method

7.1. The attention of interested consulting firms is drawn to paragraph 1.9 of the World
Bank’s Guidelines: Selection and Employment of Consultants under IBRD Loans and IDA
Credits & Grants by World Bank Borrowers [January 2011] (“Consultant Guidelines”),
setting forth the World Bank’s policy on conflict of interest.

7.2. A consulting firm will be selected in accordance with the Selection Based on
Consultants Qualification (CQS) method set out in the World Bank’s Guidelines: Selection
and Employment of Consultants (under IBRD Loans & IDA Credits and Grants) by World

7.3. A consulting firm may associate with other firms in the form of a joint venture or a
sub consultancy to enhance their capability for carrying out the assignment fully,
efficiently, and with quality.

*******